EXHIBIT H

1 UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE DISTRICT OF NEW JERSEY 2 3 CIVIL ACTION NUMBER: IN RE: VALSARTAN PRODUCTS 19-md-02875-RBK-KMW LIABILITY LITIGATION 5 CASE MANAGEMENT CONFERENCE via TELEPHONE 6 7 Mitchell H. Cohen Building & U.S. Courthouse 4th & Cooper Streets 8 Camden, New Jersey 08101 March 30, 2022 9 Commencing at 10:01 a.m. 10 BEFORE: THE HONORABLE ROBERT B. KUGLER, UNITED STATES DISTRICT JUDGE 11 SPECIAL MASTER THE HONORABLE THOMAS I. VANASKIE (RET.) 12 APPEARANCES: 13 MAZIE SLATER KATZ & FREEMAN, LLC 14 BY: ADAM M. SLATER, ESQUIRE 103 Eisenhower Parkway 15 Roseland, New Jersey 07068 For the Plaintiffs 16 NEWLANDS & CLARK 17 BY: JEREMIAH FUES, ESQUIRE 11161 East State Road 70, Suites 110-168 18 Lakewood Ranch, Florida 34202 For the Plaintiffs 19 FARR LAW FIRM 20 BY: GEORGE T. WILLIAMSON, ESQUIRE 99 Nesbit Street 21 Punta Gorda, Florida 33950 For the Plaintiffs 22 Ann Marie Mitchell, Official Court Reporter 23 AnnMarie@AMreporting.com (856) 906-8171 24 Proceedings recorded by mechanical stenography; transcript 25 produced by computer-aided transcription.

Document 2023-9 File PageID: 66189

1	APPEARANCES (Continued):	
2	DUANE MORRIS LLP BY: JESSICA PRISELAC, ESQUIRE	
3	30 South 17th Street	
4	Philadelphia, Pennsylvania 19103 For the Defendants, Prinston Pharmaceuticals,	
5	Solco Healthcare U.S. LLC, and Zhejiang Huahai Pharmaceuticals Ltd.	
6	SKADDEN, ARPS, SLATE, MEAGHER & FLOM LLP	
7	BY: JESSICA D. MILLER, ESQUIRE 1440 New York Avenue, N.W.	
8	Washington, DC 20005 For the Defendants, Prinston Pharmaceuticals,	
9	Solco Healthcare U.S. LLC, and Zhejiang Huahai Pharmaceuticals Ltd.	
10	PIETRAGALLO GORDON ALFANO BOSICK & RASPANTI LLP	
11	BY: CLEM C. TRISCHLER, ESQUIRE One Oxford Centre, 38th Floor	
12	Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania 15219 For the Defendant, Mylan Pharmaceuticals, Inc.	
13	GREENBERG TRAURIG LLP	
14	BY: STEVEN M. HARKINS, ESQUIRE 3333 Piedmont Road, NE, Suite 2500	
15	Atlanta, Georgia 30305 For the Defendants, Teva Pharmaceutical Industries Ltd.,	
16	Teva Pharmaceuticals USA, Inc., Actavis LLC, and Actavis Pharma, Inc.	
17	ALSO PRESENT:	
18	LORETTA SMITH, ESQUIRE	
19	Judicial Law Clerk to The Honorable Robert B. Kugler	
20	Larry MacStravic, Courtroom Deputy	
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

1.3

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

```
(PROCEEDINGS held telephonically before The Honorable
ROBERT B. KUGLER and Special Master the Honorable THOMAS I.
VANASKIE (RET.) at 10:01 a.m.)
         SPECIAL MASTER VANASKIE: Why don't we get started
with our conference call. We have Ann Marie as our court
reporter today. This should not take a whole lot of time.
         I'll proceed in the order of the defense agenda
letter that was submitted yesterday and go from there, and
then we'll get Judge Kugler on the line. I understand Judge
Kugler is back from Florida now.
         All right. Who will be addressing these matters for
the defense?
         MS. PRISELAC: Your Honor, this is Jessica Priselac
from Duane Morris.
         As you probably read in our letter, going forward,
the ZHP parties and the defense executive committee will be
represented by Jessica Miller of the Skadden firm; but for
today's topics, the majority of them are going to be handled
by other members of the joint defense group, and I believe
this first topic will be handled by our colleagues at the
Pietragallo firm.
         SPECIAL MASTER VANASKIE: Okay. Thanks, Jessica.
And I was aware of the letter from Mr. Goldberg.
         And in terms of the appointment of Jessica Miller to
the executive committee and to serve as liaison counsel, that
```

Document 2023-9

1 will be a matter, obviously, for Judge Kugler. 2 So Mr. Trischler, will you be addressing this first 3 issue, that is, the request for production of valsartan 4 testing documents from Ron Najafi? 5 MR. TRISCHLER: Yes. Good morning, Your Honor. 6 will -- this is Clem Trischler. I can address that issue on 7 behalf of the defendants. 8 SPECIAL MASTER VANASKIE: All right. And who will be 9 addressing this matter for the plaintiffs? 10 MR. SLATER: Good morning, Your Honor. Adam Slater. 11 SPECIAL MASTER VANASKIE: All right, Mr. Slater. 12 So let's hear from Mr. Trischler. I know there's 1.3 nothing for me to decide right now, but you put it on the 14 agenda letter and gave me -- submitted to the Court a number 15 of exhibits in connection with this matter. 16 So what did you want to -- what more did you want to 17 say on this matter today, Mr. Trischler? 18 MR. TRISCHLER: Your Honor, you know, I think that essentially what we need is a briefing schedule on the issue. 19 20 I know that there's been -- plaintiffs have suggested that, 21 you know, there's a willingness to continue to meet and 22 confer, and we're happy to do so. But I think the issue is an 23 important one, and I suspect from everything I've seen and 24 read, it's an issue that the Court is going to have to decide, 25 which is why -- and the thought was we should put it on the

1.3

agenda now and bring it to the Court's attention.

And if I could just take a minute, Ron Najafi is -SPECIAL MASTER VANASKIE: Yes.

MR. TRISCHLER: Thank you. Ron Najafi is a class expert that the plaintiff has identified to offer the opinion that any generic product containing NDEA or NDMA at levels — at any level is not equivalent to the branded products of Novartis and that the mere presence of these impurities at any level renders a drug misbranded and adulterated. And as you undoubtedly noted in our submissions, Mr. Najafi testified in his deposition that his lab has conducted testing of valsartan-containing medications, both independently and also apparently did some testing to validate third-party testing done by an outfit called Valisure.

We want the results of that testing and the data underlying that testing. We believe it will undermine his core opinion in this case, that equivalence requires a generic and branded product to have matching impurity profiles. There is no such requirement that exists, but Najafi suggests it does. And the testing from Valisure, as we demonstrated in his deposition, shows that Novartis's product contains NDEA in it. It was tested and shown to contain NDEA in it. And if this expert, who is saying that any product that has any level of this nitrosamine impurity is misbranded and adulterated and is not equivalent to the brand, the fact that the brand

1.3

product has it undermines his sworn testimony. I think the information is plainly relevant.

If there is -- if we can resolve it through meet and confer, I'm happy to, but we haven't been able to do so in the 30 plus days since Mr. Najafi's deposition. And so if we can't do it, I'd just like -- you know, my thought is perhaps we can just set up a briefing schedule now. And if we can resolve it before briefs are due, we'll notify the Court. But if not, perhaps we can set a briefing schedule so we can get a resolution, because I think what testing this man has done or is aware of on nitrosamine levels in valsartan-containing medications of the brand product, of the defendant's product, of other generic products, it's all directly relevant to the Rule 23 issues that the Court is going to have to decide.

SPECIAL MASTER VANASKIE: All right. Mr. Slater?
MR. SLATER: Hello, Judge.

The first thing I want to say is I find it interesting that the defense puts an issue into the agenda letter that they say there's no issue to be decided and is now arguing as if there's an issue to be decided. I thought that wasn't how we operate around here. That's number one.

Number two, the agenda letter didn't ask for a briefing schedule by the defense. The defense said they got our response, which I can assure you disposes of the issue, and they said they wanted to meet and confer further. So now

1.3

Mr. Trischler wants a briefing schedule.

We certainly agree that if they're going to put this issue before the Court, it will require a briefing schedule, because we're going to want to fully brief it, because much of what Mr. Trischler is saying is just not accurate.

For example, I think to balance a little bit of what you heard, what they're going for is they think that they've suddenly found the Holy Grail of defense in this case and have proven that Diovan, the brand name product, had NDMA and DMF in it, by the way, because Valisure's petition was focused mostly on DMF. And I know Your Honor is well aware of this because you've lived this now with us long enough.

When ZHP changed the manufacturing process to substitute DMF for triethylamine, which had substituted for tributyltin, meaning they went from the branded manufacturing process to another process and ultimately to the zinc chloride process, the zinc chloride process introduced DMF, which then led to NDMA being produced as a byproduct of the chemical reactions.

So they somehow think they're going to prove that Diovan had not only NDMA in it but also DMF, because the Valisure citizen's petition filed in June 2019 was focused on DMF and then NDMA. So as a matter of chemistry, it's impossible for Diovan made by the brand name manufacturing process to contain DMF and NDMA. It's chemically impossible.

1.3

The only way you could ever find that in Diovan would be if somebody got it onto the testing -- got those byproducts onto the testing apparatus as a contaminant, I suppose, or somebody dumped it in at some -- under some weird circumstances.

That's number one.

PageID: 66195

Number two, Valisure, which the plaintiffs have no affiliation with, didn't list Diovan as being tested. They listed Novartis valsartan. Valsartan is the generic version made by a different manufacturing process most likely. And certainly we know that the Novartis valsartan in Europe -- which maybe they got those samples. It sounds fairly likely. We know that that product was susceptible to have DMF and NDMA in it, because the reason we all are here today and the reason we know about all this is because when Novartis was buying API from ZHP, which they did for years, they did what ZHP failed to do, and they actually evaluated the product, looked at the unknown peaks that were showing up after the toluene peak, and they actually went forward and actually had a lab test with available technology and said, hey, there's NDMA in your product.

And after some pushback from ZHP, which we all know wasn't surprised by this or couldn't be since they had known for about a year already that there was NDMA in their valsartan going back to at least July 2017, as the Court knows, but they pretended not to know and pretended this was a

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

1.3

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

our information.

Document 2023-9 PageID: 66196

big surprise and tried to get Novartis off this as they had done with some other companies for the last year or two. when Novartis pushed back and said, no, you need to do something about this, that's when it came out. So remember all that history. So Novartis was buying contaminated API from ZHP, and that was their European arm. So you put all this together, Valisure never said that they tested Diovan. Dr. Najafi testified he never tested And what we have demonstrated to the defense, or represented, apparently our word isn't good enough, is that Dr. Najafi went back on this confidential testing he did to see if any of the results -- he had a number of samples that were blinded to him. And he looked at the results he had gotten for DMF and NDMA, and none of them matched the Novartis valsartan. None of them matched. So not only is it not Diovan, but what he tested, his results didn't match the samples that Valisure actually put in their petition. That's a snapshot just to answer some of what -- some of the comments that Mr. Trischler made, which just simply were not accurate. And all of this today is just -- is put in front of the Court, unfortunately, I think just to create some

If you want to talk more, let's talk, but

sort of an impression. Because if there's no issue -- we

asked the defense multiple times yesterday, we've given you

don't put this in front of the Court when you're not asking

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

1.3

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

Document 2023-9

```
for relief to just try to make it look bad or something.
they wanted to do this.
         So we're not happy with the fact this was presented.
I wanted to give Your Honor a little bit of balance to what
you heard from Mr. Trischler.
         If they're going to actually push this after they
meet and confer, as they represented they were going to, we're
hoping we can convince them not to do that and not waste the
Court's time with yet another briefed issue. But if so, we
definitely want the opportunity to see their brief and respond
to it and provide to the Court the full story.
         Thank you, Your Honor.
         SPECIAL MASTER VANASKIE: Thank you, Mr. Slater.
         Brief response, Mr. Trischler?
         MR. TRISCHLER:
                         Sure, Your Honor. Thank you.
         When I listened to Mr. Slater's comments, I was
harkened back to -- I think it was President Reagan who was
trying to negotiate a disarmament deal with the then Soviet
      And I think, you know, he was talking about how do we
go about doing that. And he said, trust but verify.
         And the plaintiffs' position on this issue is we're
supposed to trust them, Judge, but they leave out the
verification part, which is what discovery is all about.
get to trust but verify. So Mr. Slater is continuing to
represent and has represented, and you heard him here this
```

2

3

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

1.3

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

morning, that despite the sworn testimony from the witness, who on page 141 and 142, I'm looking at his transcript now, says that he tested -- independently tested and verified the Valisure results which showed testing of Novartis product, despite all that, they never tested Diovan. We should trust that. Well, in discovery, though, Judge, we get to verify that. And trust but verify. And that's what we're asking to That's what the rules provide. I think we're entitled to Again, we're happy to meet and confer. I'm sorry Mr. Slater is unhappy that we brought an issue, a discovery issue, to the Court's attention, but I think that's been a practice throughout this proceeding, and that's what the agenda statement and these meetings are for, to let the Court be aware of issues on the horizon. I'm not happy that we haven't gotten the documents yet after 30 plus days after the deposition, but that's why we're bringing the issue to the Court's attention, to raise it. If this man tested valsartan, whatever valsartan he tested, it's relevant. If it shows variation across various manufacturers, that's relevant to the predominance issues in the Rule 23 hearing. This information is relevant on many levels, and not to mention the fact that the witness's

Document 2023-9

PageID: 66198

testimony was inconsistent as to what testing he did on what

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

1.3

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

```
products. So we ought to be entitled to the documentation
that was asked for in the notice of deposition to find out
what he tested, when he tested, what was done, and what it all
means.
         And so again, if we -- based on the arguments I've
heard today, I don't see a resolution at hand. We're willing
to try, but I think the prudent thing to do would be to set up
a briefing schedule. We can meet and confer before then to
see if we can resolve it. I hope we can, but I'm not
optimistic. But let's get it resolved, because I think it's
an important issue.
         MR. SLATER: Your Honor, if I could briefly respond
for a moment, please.
         SPECIAL MASTER VANASKIE: Certainly, Mr. Slater.
         MR. SLATER: Sure. I appreciate Mr. Trischler's
harkening back to Ronald Reagan with his negotiations with the
Soviet Union. I'm sure it's a warm spot for all of us to
remember history a little bit.
         I assume Mr. Trischler also wants to get discovery
from Health Canada, which tested brand name Diovan and found
there's no NDMA in it, because why should we believe Health
Canada or the FDA, which never recalled or made any comments
about Diovan having any issues. And the FDA I'm sure tested
all this too. So I'm sure he'll be requesting that from them.
```

Document 2023-9

PageID: 66199

The rest of what he said, I can just tell you, are

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

1.3

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

13

```
not fully accurate statements. They're bits and pieces of
accurate statements and bits and pieces of what the witness
didn't say. But we know that the witness got blinded samples,
so he'll never know specifically what he tested because he
wasn't told.
         Now, if they don't believe us and Your Honor orders
it, we'll deal with it.
         And I'll just say that the rest of the testimony on
Valisure was that since he wasn't named in the petition, he
doesn't think he actually did any testing on the sample that
Valisure actually put in its petition because the results
don't match up. So whatever he tested came up with different
numbers than what Valisure reported, which would mean they
were different samples.
         Again, I'm just responding because Mr. Trischler is
just throwing things onto the record, and I don't want to
leave the impression that we don't have answers for every
single thing he has to say. I'm hoping that in the meet and
confer, which he's not been involved with at all; a few of his
partners have been involved in this. Maybe they will speak to
us and maybe they'll -- we'll find a solution. But another --
if we can't, I am sure that Your Honor will hear from us, and
we'll request a briefing schedule. Thank you.
         SPECIAL MASTER VANASKIE: All right. Thank you.
```

think the appropriate thing to do here is to set a briefing

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

1.3

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

```
schedule but first ask, within what time frame can you conduct
the meet and confer on this -- I'd like you to exhaust that
approach first before submitting briefs. Obviously, you would
too.
         And the other related question is, well, how much
time do you need to submit your brief.
         I take it, Mr. Trischler, you'll go first on this
issue. And how much time do you need to submit your brief?
         MR. TRISCHLER: I would think we could present it in
ten days, two weeks, something like that, Your Honor, and then
commit to meet and conferring before that time period expires.
         SPECIAL MASTER VANASKIE: All right. Let's give you
two weeks to submit your briefs.
                                 That gives you ample time to
conduct a meet and confer on this issue. Perhaps it will be
resolved, perhaps it won't. But two weeks from today takes us
to what, April 12th? April 13th. So April 13th would be the
deadline for a brief from the defendants on this testing
conducted by Mr. Najafi.
         In the meantime, I direct that you meet and confer in
an effort to try to resolve this matter so that it is
unnecessary to get a resolution from the Court.
         How much time would you like, Mr. Slater -- I know
it's a little difficult because you haven't seen a brief yet,
but how much time would you like to respond?
         MR. SLATER: I would say I just -- because I don't --
```

```
1
    I don't know what everybody's schedules are, as Your Honor
 2
    said, we don't know what the brief is going to show, I would
 3
    say ten days.
 4
             SPECIAL MASTER VANASKIE: All right. We'll give you
 5
    to the 25th of April.
 6
             MR. SLATER: Thank you.
 7
             SPECIAL MASTER VANASKIE: All right. And I'll
 8
    consider the matter ripe upon receipt of the defense brief and
 9
    then the plaintiffs' brief. And I'll keep an open mind with
10
    respect to whether to schedule a conference call to hear
11
    argument on it.
12
             Is that acceptable to the defense?
1.3
             MR. TRISCHLER: It is, Your Honor. Thank you.
14
             SPECIAL MASTER VANASKIE: All right. And acceptable
15
    to the plaintiff?
16
             MR. SLATER: Absolutely. Thank you, Judge.
17
             SPECIAL MASTER VANASKIE: All right. Thank you.
18
             MS. PRISELAC: Your Honor, this is Jessica Priselac
19
    for the ZHP parties, if I just may for one moment.
20
             SPECIAL MASTER VANASKIE: Yes.
21
             MS. PRISELAC: We have no intention of arguing the
22
    merits of the case at this moment, but given that Mr. Slater
23
    just made a very long statement about the ZHP parties and
24
    their actions, I just want to make a note for the record that
25
    obviously we believe several of the statements that Mr. Slater
```

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

14

15

18

19

20

21

22

```
made are not borne out by the record and are scientifically
    inaccurate, but I am sure the defense group will clarify the
    record in the briefing.
             SPECIAL MASTER VANASKIE: Very well. Anything else
    on that, Ms. Priselac?
                                  Thank you, Your Honor, for that
             MS. PRISELAC: Yes.
    chance to respond briefly.
             SPECIAL MASTER VANASKIE: All right. Thank you very
    much.
             I think that the rest of the agenda are matters for
    Judge Kugler. You have the motion for clarification of the
    Order Number 1 on the Daubert motions. That's pending. And
1.3
    the briefing deadlines on class certification, I think that
    has to be addressed by Judge Kugler. As I mentioned, the
    appointment of Jessica Miller of the Skadden firm to the
16
    defense executive committee and as liaison counsel is a matter
17
    for Judge Kugler. And then obviously, the matters dealing
    with individual plaintiffs' claims is a matter for Judge
    Kugler.
             So is there anything else that either side would like
    to bring to my attention now?
             MR. SLATER: Nothing for plaintiffs, Your Honor.
23
                           Nothing for defendants, Your Honor.
             MS. PRISELAC:
24
             SPECIAL MASTER VANASKIE: All right. Very well.
25
    Thank you. I will drop off the call, contact Judge Kugler,
```

Document 2023-9

```
1
    get him on the call, and we'll go from there.
 2
             Thank you all very much.
 3
             (Pause in proceedings.)
 4
             THE COURT: Good morning, it's Judge Kugler calling
 5
         How is everybody today?
 6
             RESPONSE: Good morning, Your Honor.
 7
             THE COURT: All right. Do we have we have a court
 8
    reporter? Camille, somebody?
 9
             COURT REPORTER: It's Ann Marie, Your Honor.
10
             THE COURT: Ann Marie, how are you doing?
11
             We have a number of things to go over, so let's
12
    start.
1.3
             First, and probably more importantly than anything
14
    else, is the advice that Duane Morris and Mr. Goldberg, et
15
    cetera, are withdrawing from the case. The Skadden firm will
16
    be taking over for their clients as of tomorrow, I guess,
17
    formally, and Ms. Jessica -- Ms. Miller seeks to be appointed
18
    as defense liaison counsel in place of Mr. Goldberg and to be
19
    appointed a member of the executive committee.
20
             Ms. Miller, are you on the phone?
21
             MS. MILLER: I am, Your Honor. Good morning.
22
             THE COURT: Good morning. How are you?
23
             MS. MILLER: I'm nervous, Your Honor.
24
             THE COURT:
                        Why?
25
             MS. MILLER: I don't know what I'm getting into.
```

Document 2023-9

```
1
             THE COURT: We're nice people. We really are.
 2
             MS. MILLER: Good.
 3
             THE COURT: What I want to do, Ms. Cohen's agenda
 4
    letter indicates that all defense counsel consent to your
 5
    appointment. And I assume that to be true. But I'm going to
 6
    leave it open for a few days just in case there is any
 7
    objection. I can't imagine there will be, but if there is, we
 8
    can deal with it.
 9
             So how about in about five days we'll do an order
10
    appointing you formally as liaison counsel and a member of the
11
    executive committee. Okay?
12
             MS. MILLER: Thank you, Your Honor. I hope to do a
1.3
    good job at it.
14
             THE COURT: I'm sure you will. And I'm sorry
15
    Mr. Goldberg is not on the line. Apparently -- he told me he
16
    had some scheduling difficulties. And I wanted to thank him
17
    for all the work he's done in this case. I know it's been a
18
    heavy lift for him and everyone else, but I appreciate all
19
    that he accomplished in this case.
20
             All right. So there is this pending -- defendants'
21
    pending motion for clarification regarding the experts Lagana
22
    and Hecht about -- particularly about NDEA and their --
23
    whether and to what extent they will be able to testify about
24
    that. The plaintiff has responded that they will submit
25
    something on or before April 4th on that.
```

2

3

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

1.3

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

```
May I suggest that the two sides just talk to each
other first? I mean, maybe you can work this out. Otherwise,
it's not that big a deal, folks. I mean, it's not something
that has to be decided immediately. I don't know why we can't
wait until trial to see if Lagana and Hecht actually testify
at trial before we have to further set forth the parameters of
what they're going to say. I mean, the plaintiffs may not
even use them as experts in the testimony and may not ask them
any questions about NDEA. But I think the two sides ought
talk about that issue, because there may be some basis to
resolve that. If not, then we'll get to it eventually.
         All right. Because of the substitution of counsel,
you've asked for an extension of seven days for the opposition
to the class cert motions, and then of course the plaintiffs
want a period of time, additional time, then to respond.
that's fine.
             That's granted. We'll get that teed up
eventually.
                       Thank you, Your Honor.
         MS. PRISELAC:
         THE COURT: I think that leads us now to the pending
orders to show cause.
         Who is going to speak for defendants on that?
         MR. HARKINS: Good morning, Your Honor.
                                                 This is
Steve Harkins with Greenberg Traurig for the Teva defendants
and the joint defense group.
         THE COURT: Now, as I understand it, the Ernestine
```

```
1
    Williams matter has been resolved, so we can dismiss that
    order to show cause.
 2
 3
             The Charlene Mills and Jimmie Thorn matters you're
 4
    trying to work out, and you asked that to be relisted next
 5
    month.
          Correct?
 6
             MR. HARKINS: Yes, Your Honor, that's correct.
 7
             THE COURT: So that leaves Martin Scott, Tracy
 8
    Whitfield and Deborah Harris.
 9
             Any updates on that, Mr. Harkins?
10
             MR. HARKINS: We do have two updates. The Scott and
11
    Whitfield cases can both be withdrawn. So the only case in
12
    which defendants are requesting dismissal at this time is
1.3
    Harris.
14
             THE COURT: Anybody on the plaintiffs' side want to
15
    speak on behalf of the Harris matter?
16
             MR. WILLIAMSON: Your Honor, this is attorney George
17
    Williamson on behalf of the plaintiffs. I know there was a
18
    meet and confer, and so there possibly is an attorney on the
19
    phone that can speak to that specific case.
20
             THE COURT: Is there anybody who can speak to the
21
    Deborah Harris case on the phone, who wants to speak to the
22
    Deborah Harris case on the phone?
23
             (No response.)
24
             THE COURT: Apparently not. So the motion -- an
25
    order to show cause will be entered. That will be dismissed.
```

```
1
             Then you have -- you'd like to list nine for the
 2
    order to show cause returnable next month.
 3
             Any updates on those, starting with James Larsen?
 4
             MR. HARKINS: Your Honor, I have several updates.
 5
    Number 5, Jeffrey Williams, can be removed; and number 8, John
 6
    McDermott, can also be removed. And we will request orders to
 7
    show cause returnable at the next case management conference
 8
    in the other seven cases.
 9
             THE COURT: All right. So we have James Larsen;
10
    estate of William Byrnes, B-Y-R-N-E-S. We have Deborah
11
    Harris, estate of Donald Harris. We have Estate of Sloan,
12
    S-L-O-A-N, Mitchell. We have Kelly, K-E-L-L-Y, Donaldson;
1.3
    Eric Thompson; and Chadwick Wilson.
14
             Does anybody on the plaintiffs' side want to speak in
15
    regards to any of the remaining seven?
16
             MR. FUES: Your Honor, this is Jeremiah Fues for --
17
    representing plaintiffs James Larsen and Kelly Donaldson, so I
    can speak to those ones.
18
19
             THE COURT: Okay.
20
             MR. FUES: Mr. Harkins was kind enough to send me an
21
    email this morning. The bottom line is we weren't -- we
22
    provided -- we received a deficiency notice back in December
23
    for our plaintiff fact sheets and then provided amended
24
    plaintiff fact sheets in February.
25
             Apparently, and Mr. Harkins was kind enough to lay
```

Document 2023-9

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

1.3

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

this out in his email this morning, there was some additional meet and confer and position statements that I did not receive notice of. I've been trying to -- I scoured my email this morning and last night, and I checked with my partners, they haven't found any either. But apparently there are still a couple of deficiencies that they've listed out here that are -- still need correcting. And we're more than happy to, you know, get that information and correct it. So I don't think it's necessary for a show cause order at this time. Specifically, I know for Kelly Donaldson the deficiencies listed in the letter are the failure to provide dates of taking valsartan, which we provided the pharmacy records. And even as of this morning, there was a little bit of an oversight, pardon, in putting the dates on the form, but I did that this morning. And they'll get that information in short order. And we also included some

Document 2023-9

PageID: 66209

But as far as the medical expenses for Larsen, obviously we can get that stuff to them in short order. just weren't aware that there was still a deficiency related to our amended PFSs. But that's our position.

approximate dates of treatment. So I think I might have to

talk to defense counsel if there's still an issue related to

the dates that we provided on that one.

THE COURT: Well, the good news is, it's four weeks before anything is going to happen to the cases. So if you

2

3

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

1.3

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

```
get this all straightened out, then they will be removed at
the next status conference in four weeks and you don't have to
worry about it. So we'll list it as an order to show cause
but on the expectation that you will cure the deficiencies so
that when we speak in -- at the end of April, that will be
removed and withdrawn.
         Okay. Orders to show cause will be entered in those
matters.
         Mr. Harkins, there are now -- I think you listed 20
that you want to formally list for the next meeting.
         Any updates on those?
         MR. HARKINS: Just one update, Your Honor. Number 15
on the list, Annie Pace, did file a PFS this morning, so we
will remove that from the agenda for next month. And we would
ask just to relist the remaining cases on next month's agenda.
         THE COURT: All right. The 19 remaining then, who
are Michael Keicher, K-E-I-C-H-E-R; Robert Sanford; Henry
Parker, Junior; Matt Jolissaint, J-O-L-I-S-S-A-I-N-T; Carl
Huston, H-U-S-T-O-N; Jeffrey Johnson; Ulysses Payne; Dexter
Turner; Nancy Mastbergen, M-A-S-T-B-E-R-G-E-N; Mario Sherber,
S-H-E-R-B-E-R; Robert Brown; Daniel Given, G-I-V-E-N; Dinah,
D-I-N-A-H, Brown; Betty Hall; Marion, M-A-R-I-O-N, Dennis;
Elie, E-L-I-E, Greene, G-R-E-E-N-E; Linda Palmer; Vincent
Anderson; and Kerry, K-E-R-Y, Jackson will be relisted for
another listing next meeting.
```

```
1
             That's all that's on the agenda.
 2
             Do you want to raise any other issues at this time?
 3
             MR. SLATER: Hello, Your Honor, it's Adam Slater.
 4
             I just wanted to tell you, we obviously will try to
 5
    meet and confer with the defense on that clarification issue.
 6
             I just wanted to ask the Court, because our deadline
 7
    to respond to cross-move is on Monday. We just want to make
 8
    sure that that deadline can be extended while we're meeting
 9
    and conferring. We would hate to get whipsawed if we don't
10
    work it out and we miss our deadline.
11
             THE COURT: Yes. Just contact me next week, let me
12
    know, send me a letter, docket it, as to where you are on that
1.3
    issue. Okay?
14
             MR. SLATER: Absolutely. Thank you, Judge.
15
             THE COURT: You also had an issue but apparently
16
    you're still working it out about these test results from this
17
    expert. Correct?
18
             MR. SLATER: Yes. That's true.
19
             MR. TRISCHLER: Correct.
20
             THE COURT: So we don't need to discuss that until
21
    maybe next month?
22
             MR. SLATER: Right. I don't think there's anything
23
    to discuss any further today from the plaintiffs' perspective.
24
             THE COURT: Okay. Any other issues that anybody
25
    wants to raise today?
```

Document 2023-9

```
1
              (No response.)
 2
             THE COURT: No? All right then.
 3
             Thank you, everybody. And we'll talk to you -- I'll
 4
    talk to you next month, the end of next month, if not sooner.
 5
    Okay? Thanks.
 6
             RESPONSE: Thank you, Your Honor.
 7
             (Proceedings concluded at 10:45 a.m.)
 8
 9
             I certify that the foregoing is a correct transcript
10
    from the record of proceedings in the above-entitled matter.
11
12
    /S/ Ann Marie Mitchell, CCR, CRR, RDR, RMR
    Court Reporter/Transcriber
13
14
    31st day of March, 2022
         Date
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
```

/ S [1] - 25:12	April [6] - 14:16, 15:5, 18:25,	certification [1] - 16:13	course [1] - 19:14
1 [1] - 16:12	23:5	certify [1] - 25:9	court [2] - 3:5, 17:7
10:01 [1] - 3:3	arguing [2] - 6:20, 15:21	cetera [1] - 17:15	COURT [1] - 17:9
10:45 [1] - 25:7	argument [1] - 15:11	Chadwick [1] - 21:13	Court [1] - 25:12
12th [1] - 14:16	arguments [1] - 12:5	chance [1] - 16:7	Court's [4] - 5:1, 10:9, 11:12,
13th [2] - 14:16	arm [1] - 9:6	changed [1] - 7:13	11:18
141 [1] - 11:2	assume [2] - 12:19, 18:5	Charlene [1] - 20:3	create [1] - 9:21
142 [1] - 11:2	assure [1] - 6:24	checked [1] - 22:4	cross [1] - 24:7
15 _[1] - 23:12	attention [4] - 5:1, 11:12,	chemical [1] - 7:18	cross-move [1] - 24:7
19 [1] - 23:16	11:18, 16:21	chemically [1] - 7:25	CRR [1] - 25:12
20 [1] - 23:9	attorney [2] - 20:16, 20:18	chemistry [1] - 7:23	cure [1] - 23:4
2017 [1] - 8:24	available [1] - 8:19	chloride [2] - 7:16, 7:17	Daniel [1] - 23:21
2019 [1] - 7:22	aware [5] - 3:23, 6:11, 7:11,	circumstances [1] - 8:4	data [1] - 5:15
2022 [1] - 25:14	11:15, 22:22	citizen's [1] - 7:22	Date [1] - 25:14
23 [2] - 6:14, 11:23	B-Y-R-N-E-S [1] - 21:10	claims [1] - 16:18	dates [4] - 22:12, 22:14, 22:17,
25th [1] - 15:5	bad [1] - 10:1	clarification [3] - 16:11, 18:21,	22:19
30 [2] - 6:5, 11:17	balance [2] - 7:6, 10:4	24:5	Daubert [1] - 16:12
31st [1] - 25:14	based [1] - 12:5	clarify [1] - 16:2	days [7] - 6:5, 11:17, 14:10,
4th [1] - 18:25	basis [1] - 19:10	class [3] - 5:4, 16:13, 19:14	15:3, 18:6, 18:9, 19:13
5 [1] - 21:5	behalf [3] - 4:7, 20:15, 20:17	Clem [1] - 4:6	deadline [4] - 14:17, 24:6, 24:8,
8 _[1] - 21:5	Betty [1] - 23:22	clients [1] - 17:16	24:10
a.m [2] - 3:3, 25:7	big [2] - 9:1, 19:3	Cohen's [1] - 18:3	deadlines [1] - 16:13
able [2] - 6:4, 18:23	bit [4] - 7:6, 10:4, 12:18, 22:14	colleagues [1] - 3:20	deal [4] - 10:18, 13:7, 18:8,
above-entitled [1] - 25:10	bits [2] - 13:1, 13:2	comments [3] - 9:19, 10:16,	19:3
absolutely [2] - 15:16, 24:14	blinded [2] - 9:13, 13:3	12:22	dealing [1] - 16:17
acceptable [2] - 15:12, 15:14	borne [1] - 16:1	commit [1] - 14:11	Deborah [4] - 20:8, 20:21,
accomplished [1] - 18:19	bottom [1] - 21:21	committee [5] - 3:16, 3:25,	20:22, 21:10
accurate [4] - 7:5, 9:20, 13:1,	brand [6] - 5:25, 6:12, 7:9, 7:24,	16:16, 17:19, 18:11	December [1] - 21:22
13:2	12:20	companies [1] - 9:2	decide [3] - 4:13, 4:24, 6:14
actions [1] - 15:24	branded [3] - 5:7, 5:18, 7:15	concluded [1] - 25:7	decided [3] - 6:19, 6:20, 19:4
Adam [2] - 4:10, 24:3	brief [10] - 7:4, 10:10, 10:14,	conduct [2] - 14:1, 14:14	defendant's [1] - 6:12
additional [2] - 19:15, 22:1	14:6, 14:8, 14:17, 14:23, 15:2,	conducted [2] - 5:11, 14:18	defendants [6] - 4:7, 14:17,
address [1] - 4:6	15:8, 15:9	confer [13] - 4:22, 6:4, 6:25,	16:23, 19:21, 19:23, 20:12
addressed [1] - 16:14	briefed [1] - 10:9	10:7, 11:10, 12:8, 13:19, 14:2,	defendants' [1] - 18:20
addressing [3] - 3:11, 4:2, 4:9	briefing [11] - 4:19, 6:7, 6:9,	14:14, 14:19, 20:18, 22:2, 24:5	defense [19] - 3:7, 3:12, 3:16,
adulterated [2] - 5:9, 5:24	6:23, 7:1, 7:3, 12:8, 13:23,	conference [4] - 3:5, 15:10,	3:19, 6:18, 6:23, 7:8, 9:9, 9:23,
advice [1] - 17:14	13:25, 16:3, 16:13	21:7, 23:2	15:8, 15:12, 16:2, 16:16, 17:18,
affiliation [1] - 8:7	briefly [2] - 12:12, 16:7	conferring [2] - 14:11, 24:9	18:4, 19:24, 22:18, 24:5
agenda [11] - 3:7, 4:14, 5:1,	briefs [3] - 6:8, 14:3, 14:13	confidential [1] - 9:11	deficiencies [3] - 22:6, 22:11,
6:18, 6:22, 11:14, 16:10, 18:3,	bring [2] - 5:1, 16:21	connection [1] - 4:15	23:4
23:14, 23:15, 24:1	bringing [1] - 11:18	consent [1] - 18:4	deficiency [2] - 21:22, 22:22
agree [1] - 7:2	brought [1] - 11:11	consider [1] - 15:8	definitely [1] - 10:10
amended [2] - 21:23, 22:23	Brown [2] - 23:21, 23:22	contact [2] - 16:25, 24:11	demonstrated [2] - 5:20, 9:9
ample [1] - 14:13	buying [2] - 8:14, 9:5	contain [2] - 5:22, 7:25	Dennis [1] - 23:22
Anderson [1] - 23:24	byproduct [1] - 7:18	containing [3] - 5:6, 5:12, 6:11	deposition [5] - 5:11, 5:21, 6:5,
Ann [4] - 3:5, 17:9, 17:10, 25:12	byproducts [1] - 8:2	contains [1] - 5:21	11:17, 12:2
Annie [1] - 23:13	Byrnes [1] - 21:10	contaminant [1] - 8:3	despite [2] - 11:1, 11:5
answer [1] - 23.13	Camille [1] - 17:8	contaminated [1] - 9:6	Dexter [1] - 23:19
	Canada [2] - 12:20, 12:22	continue [1] - 4:21	different [3] - 8:9, 13:12, 13:14
answers [1] - 13:17	Carl [1] - 23:18	continue [1] - 4.21	difficult [1] - 14:23
API [2] - 8:14, 9:6	case [12] - 5:17, 7:8, 15:22,	convince [1] - 10:8	difficulties [1] - 18:16
apparatus [1] - 8:3	17:15, 18:6, 18:17, 18:19,	core [1] - 5:17	Dinah [1] - 23:21
appointed [2] - 17:17, 17:19	20:11, 20:19, 20:21, 20:22,	correct [6] - 20:5, 20:6, 22:8,	DINAH [1] - 23:22
appointing [1] - 18:10	21:7	24:17, 24:19, 25:9	Diovan [11] - 7:9, 7:21, 7:24,
appointment [3] - 3:24, 16:15,	cases [4] - 20:11, 21:8, 22:25,	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	8:1, 8:7, 9:8, 9:9, 9:16, 11:5,
18:5	23:15	correcting [1] - 22:7	12:20, 12:23
appreciate [2] - 12:15, 18:18	CCR [1] - 25:12	counsel [7] - 3:25, 16:16,	direct [1] - 14:19
approach [1] - 14:3	cert [1] - 19:14	17:18, 18:4, 18:10, 19:12, 22:18	directly [1] - 6:13
appropriate [1] - 13:25	certainly [3] - 7:2, 8:10, 12:14	couple [1] - 22:6	disarmament [1] - 10:18
approximate [1] - 22:17	Softainiy [0] = 7.2, 0.10, 12.14	Couple [1] - 22.0	

		_	_
discovery [4] - 10:23, 11:7,	failed [1] - 8:15	Health [2] - 12:20, 12:21	Jessica [7] - 3:13, 3:17, 3:22,
11:11, 12:19	failure [1] - 22:11	hear [3] - 4:12, 13:22, 15:10	3:24, 15:18, 16:15, 17:17
discuss [2] - 24:20, 24:23	fairly [1] - 8:11	heard [4] - 7:7, 10:5, 10:25,	Jimmie [1] - 20:3
dismiss [1] - 20:1	far [1] - 22:20	12:6	job [1] - 18:13
dismissal [1] - 20:12	FDA [2] - 12:22, 12:23	hearing [1] - 11:23	John [1] - 21:5
dismissed [1] - 20:25	February [1] - 21:24	heavy [1] - 18:18	Johnson [1] - 23:19
disposes [1] - 6:24	few [2] - 13:19, 18:6	Hecht [2] - 18:22, 19:5	joint [2] - 3:19, 19:24
DMF [9] - 7:9, 7:11, 7:14, 7:17,	file [1] - 23:13	held [1] - 3:1	Jolissaint [1] - 23:18
7:21, 7:23, 7:25, 8:12, 9:14	filed [1] - 7:22	hello [2] - 6:16, 24:3	JOLISSAINT [1] - 23:18
docket [1] - 24:12	fine [1] - 19:16	Henry [1] - 23:17	Judge [14] - 3:9, 4:1, 6:16,
documentation [1] - 12:1	firm [4] - 3:17, 3:21, 16:15,	history [2] - 9:5, 12:18	10:22, 11:7, 15:16, 16:11,
documents [2] - 4:4, 11:16	17:15	Holy [1] - 7:8	16:14, 16:17, 16:18, 16:25,
Donald [1] - 21:11	first [8] - 3:20, 4:2, 6:17, 14:1,	Honor [32] - 3:13, 4:5, 4:10,	17:4, 24:14
Donaldson [3] - 21:12, 21:17,	14:3, 14:7, 17:13, 19:2	4:18, 7:11, 10:4, 10:12, 10:15,	July [1] - 8:24
22:10	five [1] - 18:9	12:12, 13:6, 13:22, 14:10, 15:1,	June [1] - 7:22
done [5] - 5:14, 6:10, 9:2, 12:3,	Florida [1] - 3:10	15:13, 15:18, 16:6, 16:22,	Junior [1] - 23:18
18:17	focused [2] - 7:10, 7:22	16:23, 17:6, 17:9, 17:21, 17:23,	keep [1] - 15:9
Dr [2] - 9:8, 9:11	folks [1] - 19:3	18:12, 19:18, 19:22, 20:6,	Keicher [1] - 23:17
drop [1] - 16:25	foregoing [1] - 25:9	20:16, 21:4, 21:16, 23:12, 24:3,	KEICHER [1] - 23:17
drug [1] - 5:9	form [1] - 22:15	25:6	Kelly [3] - 21:12, 21:17, 22:10
Duane [2] - 3:14, 17:14	formally [3] - 17:17, 18:10,	Honorable [2] - 3:1, 3:2	KELLY [1] - 21:12
due [1] - 6:8	23:10	hope [2] - 12:9, 18:12	Kerry [1] - 23:24
dumped [1] - 8:4	forth [1] - 19:6	hoping [2] - 10:8, 13:18	KERRY [1] - 23:24
effort [1] - 14:20	forward [2] - 3:15, 8:18	horizon [1] - 11:15	kind [2] - 21:20, 21:25
either [2] - 16:20, 22:5	four [2] - 22:24, 23:2	Huston [1] - 23:19	known [1] - 8:22
Elie [1] - 23:23	frame [1] - 14:1	HUSTON [1] - 23:19	knows [1] - 8:25
ELIE [1] - 23:23	front [2] - 9:21, 9:25	identified [1] - 5:5	KUGLER [1] - 3:2
email [3] - 21:21, 22:1, 22:3	FUES [2] - 21:16, 21:20	imagine [1] - 18:7	Kugler [9] - 3:9, 3:10, 4:1,
end [2] - 23:5, 25:4	Fues [1] - 21:16	immediately [1] - 19:4	16:11, 16:14, 16:17, 16:19,
entered [2] - 20:25, 23:7	full [1] - 10:11	important [2] - 4:23, 12:11	16:25, 17:4
entitled [3] - 11:9, 12:1, 25:10	fully [2] - 7:4, 13:1	importantly [1] - 17:13	lab [2] - 5:11, 8:18
equivalence [1] - 5:17	generic [4] - 5:6, 5:17, 6:13, 8:8	impossible [2] - 7:24, 7:25	Lagana [2] - 18:21, 19:5
equivalent [2] - 5:7, 5:25	George [1] - 20:16	impression [2] - 9:22, 13:17	Larsen [4] - 21:3, 21:9, 21:17,
Eric [1] - 21:13	given [2] - 9:23, 15:22	impurities [1] - 5:8	22:20
Ernestine [1] - 19:25	Given [1] - 23:21	impurity [2] - 5:18, 5:24	last [2] - 9:2, 22:4
essentially [1] - 4:19	GIVEN [1] - 23:21	inaccurate [1] - 16:2	lay [1] - 21:25
estate [2] - 21:10, 21:11	Goldberg [4] - 3:23, 17:14,	included [1] - 22:16	leads [1] - 19:19
Estate [1] - 21:11	17:18, 18:15	inconsistent [1] - 11:25	least [1] - 8:24
et [1] - 17:14	Grail [1] - 7:8	independently [2] - 5:12, 11:3	leave [3] - 10:22, 13:17, 18:6
Europe [1] - 8:10	granted [1] - 19:16	indicates [1] - 18:4	leaves [1] - 20:7
European [1] - 9:6	Greenberg [1] - 19:23	individual [1] - 16:18 information [5] - 6:2, 9:24,	led [1] - 7:18
evaluated [1] - 8:16	Greene [1] - 23:23	11:23, 22:8, 22:16	letter [9] - 3:8, 3:15, 3:23, 4:14, 6:19, 6:22, 18:4, 22:11, 24:12
eventually [2] - 19:11, 19:17	GREENE [1] - 23:23	intention [1] - 15:21	level [3] - 5:7, 5:9, 5:23
example [1] - 7:6	group [3] - 3:19, 16:2, 19:24	interesting [1] - 6:18	levels [3] - 5:6, 6:11, 11:24
executive [5] - 3:16, 3:25,	guess [1] - 17:16	introduced [1] - 7:17	liaison [4] - 3:25, 16:16, 17:18,
16:16, 17:19, 18:11 exhaust [1] - 14:2	Hall [1] - 23:22 hand [1] - 12:6	involved [2] - 13:19, 13:20	18:10
exhibits [1] - 4:15	handled [2] - 3:18, 3:20	issue [24] - 4:3, 4:6, 4:19, 4:22,	lift [1] - 18:18
exists [1] - 5:19	, ,	4:24, 6:18, 6:19, 6:20, 6:24,	likely [2] - 8:9, 8:11
expectation [1] - 23:4	happy [6] - 4:22, 6:4, 10:3, 11:10, 11:16, 22:7	7:3, 9:22, 10:9, 10:21, 11:11,	Linda [1] - 23:23
expenses [1] - 22:20	harkened [1] - 10:17	11:12, 11:18, 12:11, 14:8,	line [3] - 3:9, 18:15, 21:21
expert [3] - 5:5, 5:23, 24:17	harkening [1] - 12:16	14:14, 19:10, 22:18, 24:5,	list [5] - 8:7, 21:1, 23:3, 23:10,
experts [2] - 18:21, 19:8	HARKINS [5] - 19:22, 20:6,	24:13, 24:15	23:13
expires [1] - 14:11	20:10, 21:4, 23:12	issues [6] - 6:14, 11:15, 11:22,	listed [4] - 8:8, 22:6, 22:11,
extended [1] - 24:8	Harkins [5] - 19:23, 20:9,	12:23, 24:2, 24:24	23:9
extension [1] - 19:13	21:20, 21:25, 23:9	Jackson [1] - 23:24	listened [1] - 10:16
extent [1] - 18:23	Harris [7] - 20:8, 20:13, 20:15,	James [3] - 21:3, 21:9, 21:17	listing [1] - 23:25
fact [5] - 5:25, 10:3, 11:24,	20:21, 20:22, 21:11	Jeffrey [2] - 21:5, 23:19	lived [1] - 7:12
21:23, 21:24	hate [1] - 24:9	Jeremiah [1] - 21:16	look [1] - 10:1
<u>'</u>			

PageID: 66215

Case 1:19-md-02875-RMB-SAK

looked [2] - 8:16, 9:13 misbranded [2] - 5:9, 5:24 nothing [3] - 4:13, 16:22, 16:23 PFSs [1] - 22:23 looking [1] - 11:2 miss [1] - 24:10 notice [3] - 12:2, 21:22, 22:3 pharmacy [1] - 22:13 majority [1] - 3:18 Mitchell [2] - 21:12, 25:12 notify [1] - 6:8 phone [4] - 17:20, 20:19, 20:21, 20:22 man [2] - 6:10, 11:20 moment [3] - 12:13, 15:19, **Novartis** [9] - 5:8, 8:8, 8:10, 15:22 8:14, 9:1, 9:3, 9:5, 9:14, 11:4 pieces [2] - 13:1, 13:2 management [1] - 21:7 Monday [1] - 24:7 Novartis's [1] - 5:21 Pietragallo [1] - 3:21 manufacturers [1] - 11:22 manufacturing [4] - 7:13, 7:15, month [6] - 20:5, 21:2, 23:14, Number [1] - 16:12 place [1] - 17:18 24:21, 25:4 7:24, 8:9 **number** [10] - 4:14, 6:21, 6:22, plainly [1] - 6:2 March [1] - 25:14 month's [1] - 23:15 8:5, 8:6, 9:12, 17:11, 21:5, plaintiff [5] - 5:5, 15:15, 18:24, Marie [4] - 3:5, 17:9, 17:10, morning [14] - 4:5, 4:10, 11:1, 23:12 21:23, 21:24 17:4, 17:6, 17:21, 17:22, 19:22, numbers [1] - 13:13 25:12 plaintiffs [8] - 4:9, 4:20, 8:6, Mario [1] - 23:20 21:21, 22:1, 22:4, 22:13, 22:15, objection [1] - 18:7 16:22, 19:7, 19:14, 20:17, 23:13 obviously [6] - 4:1, 14:3, 15:25, 21:17 Marion [1] - 23:22 Morris [2] - 3:14, 17:14 16:17, 22:21, 24:4 plaintiffs' [6] - 10:21, 15:9, **MARION** [1] - 23:22 most [1] - 8:9 offer [1] - 5:5 16:18, 20:14, 21:14, 24:23 Martin [1] - 20:7 mostly [1] - 7:11 one [6] - 4:23, 6:21, 8:5, 15:19, plus [2] - 6:5, 11:17 Mastbergen [1] - 23:20 **MASTBERGEN**[1] - 23:20 motion [3] - 16:11, 18:21, 20:24 22:19, 23:12 position [3] - 10:21, 22:2, 22:23 Master [1] - 3:2 motions [2] - 16:12, 19:14 ones [1] - 21:18 possibly [1] - 20:18 move [1] - 24:7 open [2] - 15:9, 18:6 **practice** [1] - 11:13 **MASTER** [18] - 3:4, 3:22, 4:8, MR [27] - 4:5, 4:10, 4:18, 5:4, operate [1] - 6:21 predominance [1] - 11:22 4:11. 5:3. 6:15. 10:13. 12:14. 6:16, 10:15, 12:12, 12:15, 14:9, 13:24, 14:12, 15:4, 15:7, 15:14, **opinion** [2] - 5:5, 5:17 presence [1] - 5:8 14:25, 15:6, 15:13, 15:16, 15:17, 15:20, 16:4, 16:8, 16:24 opportunity [1] - 10:10 present [1] - 14:9 16:22, 19:22, 20:6, 20:10, opposition [1] - 19:13 presented [1] - 10:3 match [2] - 9:16, 13:12 matched [2] - 9:14, 9:15 20:16, 21:4, 21:16, 21:20, optimistic [1] - 12:10 President [1] - 10:17 23:12, 24:3, 24:14, 24:18, matching [1] - 5:18 Order [1] - 16:12 pretended [2] - 8:25 24:19, 24:22 Matt [1] - 23:18 order [9] - 3:7, 18:9, 20:2, PRISELAC [6] - 3:13, 15:18, **MS**[11] - 3:13, 15:18, 15:21, matter [12] - 4:1, 4:9, 4:15, 20:25, 21:2, 22:10, 22:16, 15:21, 16:6, 16:23, 19:18 16:6, 16:23, 17:21, 17:23, 4:17, 7:23, 14:20, 15:8, 16:16, 22:21, 23:3 Priselac [3] - 3:13, 15:18, 16:5 17:25, 18:2, 18:12, 19:18 16:18, 20:1, 20:15, 25:10 orders [4] - 13:6, 19:20, 21:6, proceed [1] - 3:7 multiple [1] - 9:23 matters [5] - 3:11, 16:10, 16:17, proceeding [1] - 11:13 **Najafi** [8] - 4:4, 5:2, 5:4, 5:10, otherwise [1] - 19:2 20:3, 23:8 proceedings [2] - 17:3, 25:10 5:19, 9:8, 9:11, 14:18 McDermott [1] - 21:6 ought [2] - 12:1, 19:9 Proceedings [1] - 25:7 Najafi's [1] - 6:5 mean [4] - 13:13, 19:2, 19:3, outfit [1] - 5:14 PROCEEDINGS [1] - 3:1 name [3] - 7:9, 7:24, 12:20 oversight [1] - 22:14 19.7 process [7] - 7:13, 7:16, 7:17, named [1] - 13:9 meaning [1] - 7:15 Pace [1] - 23:13 7:25, 8:9 Nancy [1] - 23:20 means [1] - 12:4 page [1] - 11:2 produced [1] - 7:18 **NDEA** [5] - 5:6, 5:21, 5:22, meantime [1] - 14:19 Palmer [1] - 23:23 product [12] - 5:6, 5:18, 5:21, 18:22, 19:9 medical [1] - 22:20 parameters [1] - 19:6 5:23, 6:1, 6:12, 7:9, 8:12, 8:16, **NDMA**[11] - 5:6, 7:9, 7:18, medications [2] - 5:12, 6:12 8:20, 11:4 pardon [1] - 22:14 7:21, 7:23, 7:25, 8:12, 8:19, meet [14] - 4:21, 6:3, 6:25, 10:7, Parker [1] - 23:18 production [1] - 4:3 8:23, 9:14, 12:21 11:10, 12:8, 13:18, 14:2, 14:11, part [1] - 10:23 products [3] - 5:7, 6:13, 12:1 necessary [1] - 22:9 14:14, 14:19, 20:18, 22:2, 24:5 profiles [1] - 5:18 particularly [1] - 18:22 need [6] - 4:19, 9:3, 14:6, 14:8, meeting [3] - 23:10, 23:25, 24:8 parties [3] - 3:16, 15:19, 15:23 prove [1] - 7:20 22:7, 24:20 meetings [1] - 11:14 partners [2] - 13:20, 22:4 proven [1] - 7:9 **negotiate** [1] - 10:18 member [2] - 17:19, 18:10 party [1] - 5:13 provide [3] - 10:11, 11:9, 22:12 negotiations [1] - 12:16 members [1] - 3:19 pause [1] - 17:3 provided [4] - 21:22, 21:23, nervous [1] - 17:23 mention [1] - 11:24 Payne [1] - 23:19 22:12, 22:19 never [5] - 9:7, 9:8, 11:5, 12:22, mentioned [1] - 16:14 peak [1] - 8:17 prudent [1] - 12:7 13.4 mere [1] - 5:8 push [1] - 10:6 peaks [1] - 8:17 news [1] - 22:24 merits [1] - 15:22 pushback [1] - 8:21 pending [4] - 16:12, 18:20, next [12] - 20:4, 21:2, 21:7, Michael [1] - 23:17 pushed [1] - 9:3 18:21, 19:19 23:2, 23:10, 23:14, 23:15, might [1] - 22:17 put [8] - 4:13, 4:25, 7:2, 9:7, people [1] - 18:1 23:25, 24:11, 24:21, 25:4 MILLER [5] - 17:21, 17:23, perhaps [4] - 6:6, 6:9, 14:14, 9:17, 9:20, 9:25, 13:11 nice [1] - 18:1 17:25, 18:2, 18:12 14:15 puts [1] - 6:18 night [1] - 22:4 Miller [5] - 3:17, 3:24, 16:15, period [2] - 14:11, 19:15 putting [1] - 22:14 nine [1] - 21:1 17:17, 17:20 perspective [1] - 24:23 questions [1] - 19:9 nitrosamine [2] - 5:24, 6:11 Mills [1] - 20:3 petition [5] - 7:10, 7:22, 9:17, raise [3] - 11:18, 24:2, 24:25 none [2] - 9:14, 9:15 mind [1] - 15:9 13:9, 13:11 RDR [1] - 25:12 note [1] - 15:24 minute [1] - 5:2 PFS [1] - 23:13 reactions [1] - 7:19 noted [1] - 5:10

Document 2023-9

PageID: 66216

read [2] - 3:15, 4:24 Reagan [2] - 10:17, 12:16 really [1] - 18:1 reason [2] - 8:13 recalled [1] - 12:22 receipt [1] - 15:8 receive[1] - 22:2 received [1] - 21:22 record [5] - 13:16, 15:24, 16:1, 16:3, 25:10 records [1] - 22:13 regarding [1] - 18:21 regards [1] - 21:15 related [3] - 14:5, 22:18, 22:22 relevant [5] - 6:2, 6:13, 11:21, 11:22, 11:23 relief [1] - 10:1 relist [1] - 23:15 relisted [2] - 20:4, 23:24 remaining [3] - 21:15, 23:15, 23:16 remember [2] - 9:5, 12:18 remove [1] - 23:14 removed [4] - 21:5, 21:6, 23:1, 23.6 renders [1] - 5:9 reported [1] - 13:13 reporter [2] - 3:6, 17:8 **REPORTER** [1] - 17:9 Reporter/Transcriber[1] -25:12 represent [1] - 10:25 represented [4] - 3:17, 9:10, 10:7, 10:25 representing [1] - 21:17 request [3] - 4:3, 13:23, 21:6 requesting [2] - 12:24, 20:12 require [1] - 7:3 requirement [1] - 5:19 requires [1] - 5:17 resolution [3] - 6:10, 12:6, 14.21 resolve [5] - 6:3, 6:8, 12:9, 14:20, 19:11 resolved [3] - 12:10, 14:15, respect [1] - 15:10 respond [6] - 10:10, 12:12, 14:24, 16:7, 19:15, 24:7 responded [1] - 18:24 responding [1] - 13:15 response [4] - 6:24, 10:14, 20:23, 25:1 **RESPONSE** [2] - 17:6, 25:6 rest [3] - 12:25, 13:8, 16:10 results [7] - 5:15, 9:12, 9:13, 9:16, 11:4, 13:11, 24:16 **RET** [1] - 3:3 returnable [2] - 21:2, 21:7

ripe [1] - 15:8 RMR [1] - 25:12 Robert [2] - 23:17, 23:21 **ROBERT**[1] - 3:2 Ron [3] - 4:4, 5:2, 5:4 Ronald [1] - 12:16 Rule [2] - 6:14, 11:23 rules [1] - 11:9 sample [1] - 13:10 samples [5] - 8:11, 9:12, 9:17, 13:3. 13:14 Sanford [1] - 23:17 schedule [10] - 4:19, 6:7, 6:9, 6:23, 7:1, 7:3, 12:8, 13:23, 14:1, 15:10 schedules [1] - 15:1 **scheduling** [1] - 18:16 scientifically [1] - 16:1 Scott [2] - 20:7, 20:10 scoured [1] - 22:3 see [5] - 9:12, 10:10, 12:6, 12:9, 19:5 seeks [1] - 17:17 send [2] - 21:20, 24:12 serve [1] - 3:25 set [5] - 6:7, 6:9, 12:7, 13:25, seven [3] - 19:13, 21:8, 21:15 several [2] - 15:25, 21:4 sheets [2] - 21:23, 21:24 Sherber [1] - 23:20 SHERBER [1] - 23:21 **short** [2] - 22:16, 22:21 **show** [9] - 15:2, 19:20, 20:2, 20:25, 21:2, 21:7, 22:9, 23:3, 23:7 showed [1] - 11:4 showing [1] - 8:17 **shown** [1] - 5:22 **shows** [2] - 5:21, 11:21 side [3] - 16:20, 20:14, 21:14 sides [2] - 19:1, 19:9 simply [1] - 9:19 single [1] - 13:18 Skadden [3] - 3:17, 16:15, **SLATER** [12] - 4:10, 6:16, 12:12, 12:15, 14:25, 15:6, 15:16, 16:22, 24:3, 24:14, 24:18, 24:22 **Slater** [11] - 4:10, 4:11, 6:15, 10:13, 10:24, 11:11, 12:14, 14:22, 15:22, 15:25, 24:3 Slater's [1] - 10:16 Sloan [1] - 21:11 **SLOAN**[1] - 21:12 snapshot [1] - 9:18 solution [1] - 13:21 sooner [1] - 25:4

sorry [2] - 11:10, 18:14 sort [1] - 9:22 sounds [1] - 8:11 Soviet [2] - 10:18, 12:17 Special [1] - 3:2 **SPECIAL** [18] - 3:4, 3:22, 4:8, 4:11, 5:3, 6:15, 10:13, 12:14, 13:24, 14:12, 15:4, 15:7, 15:14, 15:17, 15:20, 16:4, 16:8, 16:24 specific [1] - 20:19 specifically [2] - 13:4, 22:10 spot [1] - 12:17 start [1] - 17:12 started [1] - 3:4 **starting** [1] - 21:3 statement [2] - 11:14, 15:23 statements [4] - 13:1, 13:2, 15:25, 22:2 status [1] - 23:2 Steve [1] - 19:23 still [5] - 22:5, 22:7, 22:18, 22:22, 24:16 story [1] - 10:11 straightened [1] - 23:1 stuff [1] - 22:21 submissions [1] - 5:10 **submit** [4] - 14:6, 14:8, 14:13, 18:24 submitted [2] - 3:8, 4:14 **submitting** [1] - 14:3 substitute [1] - 7:14 substituted [1] - 7:14 substitution [1] - 19:12 suddenly [1] - 7:8 suggest [1] - 19:1 suggested [1] - 4:20 suggests [1] - 5:19 suppose [1] - 8:3 supposed [1] - 10:22 surprise [1] - 9:1 surprised [1] - 8:22 susceptible [1] - 8:12 suspect [1] - 4:23 sworn [2] - 6:1, 11:1 technology [1] - 8:19 teed [1] - 19:16 telephonically [1] - 3:1 ten [2] - 14:10, 15:3 terms [1] - 3:24 test [2] - 8:18, 24:16 tested [16] - 5:22, 8:7, 9:8, 9:16, 11:3, 11:5, 11:20, 11:21, 12:3, 12:20, 12:23, 13:4, 13:12 testified [2] - 5:10, 9:8 testify [2] - 18:23, 19:5 testimony [5] - 6:1, 11:1, 11:25, 13:8. 19:8 testing [15] - 4:4, 5:11, 5:13, 5:15, 5:16, 5:20, 6:10, 8:2, 8:3,

9:11, 11:4, 11:25, 13:10, 14:17 Teva[1] - 19:23 the Court [35] - 4:14, 4:24, 6:8, 6:14, 7:3, 8:24, 9:21, 9:25, 10:11, 11:14, 14:21, 17:4, 17:7, 17:10, 17:22, 17:24, 18:1, 18:3, 18:14, 19:19, 19:25, 20:7, 20:14, 20:20, 20:24, 21:9, 21:19, 22:24, 23:16, 24:6, 24:11, 24:15, 24:20, 24:24, 25:2 the witness [3] - 11:1, 13:2, 13:3 they've [2] - 7:7, 22:6 third [1] - 5:13 third-party [1] - 5:13 THOMAS [1] - 3:2 **Thompson** [1] - 21:13 **Thorn** [1] - 20:3 throughout [1] - 11:13 throwing [1] - 13:16 today [9] - 3:6, 4:17, 8:13, 9:20, 12:6, 14:15, 17:5, 24:23, 24:25 today's [1] - 3:18 together [1] - 9:7 toluene [1] - 8:17 tomorrow [1] - 17:16 topic [1] - 3:20 topics [1] - 3:18 Tracy [1] - 20:7 transcript [2] - 11:2, 25:9 Traurig [1] - 19:23 treatment [1] - 22:17 trial [2] - 19:5, 19:6 tributyltin [1] - 7:15 tried [1] - 9:1 triethylamine [1] - 7:14 Trischler [12] - 4:2, 4:6, 4:12, 4:17, 7:1, 7:5, 9:19, 10:5, 10:14, 12:19, 13:15, 14:7 **TRISCHLER** [7] - 4:5, 4:18, 5:4, 10:15, 14:9, 15:13, 24:19 Trischler's [1] - 12:15 true [2] - 18:5, 24:18 trust [5] - 10:20, 10:22, 10:24, 11:5, 11:8 try [4] - 10:1, 12:7, 14:20, 24:4 trying [3] - 10:18, 20:4, 22:3 Turner [1] - 23:20 **two** [9] - 6:22, 8:6, 9:2, 14:10, 14:13, 14:15, 19:1, 19:9, 20:10 ultimately [1] - 7:16 Ulysses [1] - 23:19 under [1] - 8:4 underlying [1] - 5:16 undermine [1] - 5:16 undermines [1] - 6:1 undoubtedly [1] - 5:10 unfortunately [1] - 9:21

unhappy [1] - 11:11 **Union** [2] - 10:19, 12:17 unknown [1] - 8:17 unnecessary [1] - 14:21 **up** [6] - 6:7, 8:17, 12:7, 13:12, 19:16

update [1] - 23:12

updates [5] - 20:9, 20:10, 21:3,

21:4, 23:11

validate [1] - 5:13

Valisure [10] - 5:14, 5:20, 7:22, 8:6, 9:7, 9:17, 11:4, 13:9,

13:11, 13:13

Valisure's [1] - 7:10

valsartan [11] - 4:3, 5:12, 6:11, 8:8, 8:10, 8:24, 9:15, 11:20,

22:12

valsartan-containing [2] -

5:12, 6:11

VANASKIE [19] - 3:3, 3:4, 3:22, 4:8, 4:11, 5:3, 6:15, 10:13, 12:14, 13:24, 14:12, 15:4, 15:7, 15:14, 15:17, 15:20, 16:4, 16:8,

16:24

variation [1] - 11:21 various [1] - 11:21 verification [1] - 10:23

verified [1] - 11:3

verify [4] - 10:20, 10:24, 11:7,

11:8

version [1] - 8:8

Vincent [1] - 23:23

wait [1] - 19:5

wants [4] - 7:1, 12:19, 20:21,

24:25

warm [1] - 12:17

waste [1] - 10:8

week [1] - 24:11

weeks [5] - 14:10, 14:13, 14:15,

22:24, 23:2

weird [1] - 8:4

whipsawed [1] - 24:9

Whitfield [2] - 20:8, 20:11

whole [1] - 3:6

William [1] - 21:10

Williams [2] - 20:1, 21:5

WILLIAMSON [1] - 20:16

Williamson [1] - 20:17

willing [1] - 12:6

willingness [1] - 4:21

Wilson [1] - 21:13

withdrawing [1] - 17:15

withdrawn [2] - 20:11, 23:6

witness's [1] - 11:24

word [1] - 9:10

worry [1] - 23:3

year [2] - 8:23, 9:2

years [1] - 8:15

yesterday[2] - 3:8, 9:23

ZHP [8] - 3:16, 7:13, 8:15, 8:21, 9:6, 15:19, 15:23

Document 2023-9

PageID: 66217

zinc [2] - 7:16, 7:17